1. Report No. FHWA/TX-10/5-5598-01-1	2. Government Accession No.		3. Recipient's Catalog No.
4. Title and Subtitle BALANCED MIX DESIGN ATTENUATING MIX (CAN		S CRACK	5. Report Date January 2010 Resubmitted: April 2010 Published: May 2010 6. Performing Organization Code
7. Author(s) Tom Scullion			8. Performing Organization Report No. Report 5-5598-01-1
9. Performing Organization Name and Add Texas Transportation Institute The Taylog A & M University	2		10. Work Unit No. (TRAIS)
The Texas A&M University College Station, Texas 77843			11. Contract or Grant No. Project 5-5598-01
12. Sponsoring Agency Name and Address Texas Department of Transpo Research and Technology Im			13. Type of Report and Period Covered Technical Report: September 2008–August 2009
P. O. Box 5080 Austin, Texas 78763-5080			14. Sponsoring Agency Code
<ul> <li>15. Supplementary Notes</li> <li>Project performed in coopera</li> <li>Administration.</li> <li>Project Title: Implementation</li> <li>URL: <u>http://tti.tamu.edu/doc</u></li> </ul>	n of Very Thin Overlay (<	_	
16. Abstract			
98 percent of the maximum d proposed OAC are then mold	5) where the optimal aspha ensity at 50 gyrations of S ed to 93 percent density ar Overlay tester. A design w ecified procedure an optim	It content (OAC) is considered uperpave Gyratory Condition then subjected to provide the performed for the num asphalt content of the subject	omputed as that which achieves ompactor. Samples at the erformance testing in the CAM mix to be placed on BUS
is identified where both the re within the acceptable range, a acceptable range of asphalt co the balance mix design proce	at several different aspha atting and cracking criteria and volumetric checks are to ontents was defined to be b dure). An optimum of 7.5 y lower than that found with	It contents, and an acc are met. An optimum then made as the final between 7.0 and 8.0 pe percent PG76-22 was	ced mix design procedure the eeptable range of asphalt contents in asphalt content is then defined step. Using this procedure the ercent (the upper limit tested in proposed with the balanced mix ric procedure. No acceptable
17. Key Words Thin Overlays, CAM Design	s, Overlay Tester	18. Distribution Statement No restrictions. This public through NTIS National Technical I Springfield, Virginia <u>http://www.ntis.gov</u>	nformation Service
	20. Security Classif.(of this pag Unclassified	e) 21. No. of Pages 14	22. Price
Form DOT F 1700.7 (8-72)		R	eproduction of completed page authorize

# BALANCED MIX DESIGN REPORT FOR LUFKIN'S CRACK ATTENUATING MIX (CAM)

by

Tom Scullion Senior Research Engineer Texas Transportation Institute

Report 5-5598-01-1 Project 5-5598-01 Project Title: Implementation of Very Thin Overlay (<1 inch) in the Lufkin District

> Performed in cooperation with the Texas Department of Transportation and the Federal Highway Administration

> > January 2010 Resubmitted: April 2010 Published: May 2010

TEXAS TRANSPORTATION INSTITUTE The Texas A&M University System College Station, Texas 77843-3135

# DISCLAIMER

The contents of this report reflect the views of the authors, who are responsible for the facts and the accuracy of the data presented herein. The contents do not necessarily reflect the official view or policies of the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) or the Texas Department of Transportation (TxDOT). This report does not constitute a standard, specification, or regulation, nor is it intended for construction, bidding, or permit purposes. The United States Government and the State of Texas do not endorse products or manufacturers. Trade or manufacturers' names appear herein solely because they are considered essential to the objective of this report. The engineer in charge was Tom Scullion, P.E. (Texas No. 62683).

# ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This implementation project was conducted for TxDOT, and the authors thank TxDOT and FHWA for their support in funding this research project. In particular, the guidance and technical assistance provided by the Project Director Richard Gracia-Boles, P.E., of the Lufkin District proved invaluable. Special thanks are also extended to Kip Smith of the Lufkin District lab for monitoring the field placement of this mix. Dr. German Claros, P.E., is acknowledged for recognizing the potential of these CAM mixes and for his help in establishing this implementation study.

## BACKGROUND

Crack Attenuating Mix (CAM) designs are made according to the volumetric procedure defined in Special Specification 3109 (now 3165) where the optimal asphalt content (OAC) is computed as that which achieves 98 percent of the maximum density at 50 gyrations of Superpave Gyratory Compactor. Samples at the proposed OAC are then molded to 93 percent density and then subjected to performance testing in the Hamburg Wheel Tracker and Overlay Tester.

## **ORIGINAL MIX DESIGN USED IN LUFKIN**

Working closely with the Lufkin District lab and a local hot mix plant, two aggregates were selected for evaluation for the CAM design proposed for BUS 59 in Lufkin, the Jones Mill 3/8-inch granite rock and Granite Mountain screenings. The mix design was developed according to TxDOT's Special Specification SS 3109, and the proposed design is shown below in Figure 1. This mix with Jones Mill granite aggregate and 8.3 percent asphalt (PG 76-22S) passed both TxDOT's performance criteria; namely the Hamburg Wheel Tracking Test (HWTT) and Overlay Test (OT). The mix passed the proposed performance criteria with the following lab results:

- HWTT 7.8 mm after 20,000 passes (< 12.5 mm)
- Overlay Tester 1510 cycles (> 750 cycles)

This mix was placed on BUS 59 in the summer of 2008.

## LABORATORY EVALUATION OF ORIGINAL MIX DESIGN

As a final evaluation of the CAM used in Lufkin it was proposed to do a laboratory redesign of the mix using the balanced mix design and to compare the optimal asphalt content with that recommended with the existing volumetric procedure. The concern is that the volumetric procedure arrives at a single asphalt content and there is no way to determine if this is the optimum. From earlier studies with the balanced design concept for most mixes it was found that there was a range of asphalt contents that meet both the HWTT and OT performance criteria. There was no way to tell that the optimum asphalt content selected with the SS 3109 volumetric procedure was within the acceptable window.

SPEC ITEM         CAM           Interval         Interval           Interval         Bin No.5           Bin No.5         Bin No.5           Sin No.6         Max           Commsk         Max           Commsk         Max           Commsk         Max           Com sk         Max           Com sk         Max           Com sk         Max           Com sk         Max           Com	SPEC ITEM         CAM           Introversion         Bin No.5           Bin No.5         Bin No.5           Bin No.5         Bin No.5           Mar         Cum.8		1	CONTRI	CONTROLLING CS.F					1							
SPECIAL INCUSION         MIX TYPE	SPECIAL FRONTSION MIX TYPE         Contract Contract           SPECIAL FRONTSION MIX TYPE         Other         A           FROJECT MANAGER:         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           Image: Second Contract Contr		_				104			_							
SPECIAL PROVISION         Amil TYPE:	SPECIAL PROVISION       MIX TYPE:       MIX TYPE:       DIST. FROM CL:       DIST. FROM CL:       DIST. FROM CL:       Contractions       Bin No.4     Bin No.5       Bin No.5     Bin No.5       Bin No.4     Bin No.5       Bin No.4     Bin No.5       Bin No.4     Bin No.5       Bin No.4     Bin No.5       Bin No.5     Bin No.5       Bin No.4     Bin No.5       Bin No.4     Bin No.5       Bin No.5     Bin No.5       Percent     Percent       Percent     Dencent       Percent     Dot 1000       Dot 000     D00       D00     D00       D00     D00       D00     D00       D00     D00       D00     D00       D00     D00				SPECI		AM			-							
MIX TYPE:         Other           FROJECT MANAGER:	MIX TYPE:         Other           FROJECT MANAGER:         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           Inter Specifications         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           Inter Specifications         Contract of redidton           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.5           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7           Completed of reddition         Com.5         Wrd           Inter Specifications         Combined of reddition           Inter Specifications         Completed of reddition           Inter Specifications         Com 0.0         Con 0.0           Inter Specifications         Inters           Inters         Percent         Percent           Inters         Com 0.0         Con 0.0           Inters         Com 0.0         Con 0.0           Inters         Con 0.0			SPECIAL	PROVI(	SION:											
FROJECT MANAGER:         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           DIST. FROM CL:         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           Enter Specifications         Enter Specifications           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7           Mod         Bin No.4         Bin No.5           Mod         Converse ubsec         Forcent 100.0%           Mod         Constant         Total Bin           Mod         Bin No.5         Bin No.5           Mod         Distressing         Compositions           Mod         Coms.         WW           Comm.%         WM         Com.8           Mod         Com.8         WM           Com         Distressing         Com.8           Mod         Com.8         WM         Com.8           Mod         Com.8         WM         Com.8           Mod         Com.8         MM         Com.8           Composition         Distressing         Com         Specification           Mod         Distressing         Com         Specification           Distressing         Com         Distressing         Specification           Distressing         Con         Distressing         Com           Distressing	FROJECT MANAGER:         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           Inter Specifications         DIST. FROM CL:         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           Enter Specifications         Enter Specifications         Continued Gradation           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Continued Gradation           Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.7           Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications           Inter Not				MIXT	YPE: O	ther										
FROLECT MANAGER:         Isst. FROM CL:         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           Isst. FROM CL:         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:         Maintaine           Isst. Freed         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Isst. Freed         No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Isst. No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Restricted oreadation           Isst. No.4         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor           Isst. No.7         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor           Isst. No.7         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor           Isst. No.7         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor           Isst. Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor           Isst. Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor           Isst. Nor         Nor         Nor         Nor <t< td=""><td>FROLECT MANAGER:         DIST. FROM CL         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           Inter Specifications         Contract of each filt No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.6         Bin No.7           Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Contract of each filt No.7         Contract of each filt No.7         Enter Specifications           Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Contract of each filt No.7         Enter Specification           Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Inter Specification         Contract of each filt No.7           Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Contract of each filt No.7         Encent 100.0%           Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Mathin         Mathin           Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification           Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification           Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification           Inter Specifi</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></t<>	FROLECT MANAGER:         DIST. FROM CL         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           Inter Specifications         Contract of each filt No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.6         Bin No.7           Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Contract of each filt No.7         Contract of each filt No.7         Enter Specifications           Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Contract of each filt No.7         Enter Specification           Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Inter Specification         Contract of each filt No.7           Inter Specifications         Inter Specifications         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Contract of each filt No.7         Encent 100.0%           Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Mathin         Mathin           Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification           Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification           Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification         Inter Specification           Inter Specifi																
DIST. FROM CL:         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           Enter Specifications         Enter Specifications           BIN FRACTIONS         Enter Specifications           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7           Image: Specifications         Combined Gradition           Image: Specifications         Media           Image: Specifications         Complexed Gradition           Image: Specification         Media	DIST. FROM CL:         CONTRACTOR DESIGN #:           Enter Specifications         Enter Specifications           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Bin No.4         Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Bin No.4         Bin No.4         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Reserved         Mred         Cum.%         Wred         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Reserved         Mred         Cum.%         Mred         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Reserved         Mred         Cum.%         Mred         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Dol         DO         DO         DO         DO         DO         Specification           Dol         DO			PROJECT	F MANA	GER											
Inter Specifications           Bin No.4         Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.7           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Combined Cradation           Comm.sc         Wrd         Comm.sc         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Dercent         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Down support         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Down support         Bin No.7         Specification           Compariso         Wrd         Cum.%         Wrd         Cum.%         Specification         Specification           Percent         Doil         DOI         DOI         DOI         Percent         Specification           Percent         Colspan=         Specification         Specification         Specification         Specification         Specification	Enter Specifications           Bin No.4         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Bin No.5         Bin No.7           Bin No.5         Bin No.7           Bin No.5         Bin No.7           Comp.         Contribut Math           Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent           Bin No.7         Specification           With Cum.% With Cum.% With Cum.% Dum %	STATION:				DIST.	FROM	I CL:		CON	<b>TRACTO</b>	R DESIGN #					
Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Combined Gradiation         Common State         State <td>Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.7           dd         h         h         h         h           dd         h         h         h         h         h           dd         h         h         h         h         h         h           dd         h         h         h         h         h         h<!--</td--><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>Enter</td><td>Specific</td><td>cations</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></td>	Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.7           dd         h         h         h         h           dd         h         h         h         h         h           dd         h         h         h         h         h         h           dd         h         h         h         h         h         h </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>Enter</td> <td>Specific</td> <td>cations</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>						Enter	Specific	cations								
Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Image: Second Secon	Bin No.4         Bin No.5         Bin No.5         Bin No.7         Bin No.7         Bin No.7           Image: Stand			<b>3IN FRAC</b>	CTIONS												
d            Total Bin            rt         Percent         Percent         Percent         Total Bin            rt         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         NMar         Lower & Upper           rtmsk         VMar         Cum.sk         VMar         Cum.sk         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         NMar           rumsk         Lumsk         Cum.sk         Lumsk         Lumsk         Lumsk         Specification         MMar           rumsk         Lumsk         Lumsk         Lumsk         Lumsk         Specification         MMar         Specification         MMar         Specification         MMar         Specification         Mar         Lumsk         Specification         Lumsk         <	d         Combined Gradation           rt         Percent         Percent         Percent         Combined Gradation           rt         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent           cum.ss         UMM         Cum.ss         UMM         Cum.ss         Percent         Percent           Passing         ws         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent           0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         Percent         Percent           Passing         wt         Cum.se         Umb         Specification         Within         Percent           0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         Percent         Percent         Percent           0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         Percent         Pe	Bin	No.3	Bin N	0.4	Bin No	<u> </u>	Bin No.6		No.7							
Image: construction of the control of the contro of the control of the control of the contro of the con	Individual         Combined Gradition         Combined Gradition           Individual         MMd         Cum.%         MMd         Cum.%         MMd           Individual         MMd         Cum.%         MMd         Cum.%         MMd         MMd           Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Specification         MMd           Resing         W         Cum.         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Specification           Resing         WMd         Cum.         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent           Passing         W         Cum.         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent           Passing         W         Cum.         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent         Percent           Percent         Dia           Dia         Dia         Dia         Dia         Dia         Dia         Dia         Dia         Dia         Dia	Texas	hydraded	77													
Image: construction of the constructine constructine constructine construction of the construction of t	Image: construction of the sector o		Lime														
Intercent         Percent         Total Bin           Intercent         Percent         Percent         100.0%         Lower & Lipper           With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         Percent         100.0%         Lower & Lipper           With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         Percent         Total Bin           %         Mith         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         Percent         Percent <td>Freend         Percent         Total Bin           ercent         Percent         Percent         Total Bin           With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         Percent         Total Bin           Reach         Percent         Percent         Percent         Total Bin         Reach/cleat         Percent         <t< td=""><td>o</td><td>Malvern, Ar. Sweethome, Ar. Cleburne, Tx.</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>Com</td><td>ined Gradai</td><td>tion</td><td></td><td></td><td></td></t<></td>	Freend         Percent         Total Bin           ercent         Percent         Percent         Total Bin           With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         With         Cum.%         Percent         Total Bin           Reach         Percent         Percent         Percent         Total Bin         Reach/cleat         Percent         Percent <t< td=""><td>o</td><td>Malvern, Ar. Sweethome, Ar. Cleburne, Tx.</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>Com</td><td>ined Gradai</td><td>tion</td><td></td><td></td><td></td></t<>	o	Malvern, Ar. Sweethome, Ar. Cleburne, Tx.									Com	ined Gradai	tion			
Intercent         Percent         Percent         100.0%         Lower & Upper         Author         Restricted         Within         Addition         Mithin         Zone         Within         Zone         Zone         Zone         Zone         Zone         Zone         Zone         Zone         Zone <thzone< th=""> <thzon< th="">         Zone<td>ercent         Percent         Percent         Tower &amp; Upper         Restricted         Mithin         Zone         Zone         <thzon< th=""> <thzon< th=""></thzon<></thzon<></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td><math>\square</math></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>Total Bin</td><td></td><td>ľ</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></thzon<></thzone<>	ercent         Percent         Percent         Tower & Upper         Restricted         Mithin         Zone         Zone <thzon< th=""> <thzon< th=""></thzon<></thzon<>					$\square$					Total Bin		ľ				
WK4         Lum.%         WK4         Lum.%         WK4         Lum.%         WK4         Lum.%         WK4         Lum.%         Lum.% <td>Wrki Cum.         Units Passing         Wrki Cum.         Cum. % Passing         Wrki Cum.         Cum. % Passing         Wrki Cum.         Cum. % Passing         Wrki Cum.         Passing         With Cum.         Passing         Passing         With Cum.         Passing         Passing<td>69.0 Percent</td><td>1.0 Percent</td><td></td><td>Percent</td><td>Pei</td><td>rcent</td><td>Perc</td><td>ent</td><td>Percent</td><td>100.0%</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td> рә</td><td>0.0110</td><td></td></td>	Wrki Cum.         Units Passing         Wrki Cum.         Cum. % Passing         Wrki Cum.         Cum. % Passing         Wrki Cum.         Cum. % Passing         Wrki Cum.         Passing         With Cum.         Passing         Passing         With Cum.         Passing         Passing <td>69.0 Percent</td> <td>1.0 Percent</td> <td></td> <td>Percent</td> <td>Pei</td> <td>rcent</td> <td>Perc</td> <td>ent</td> <td>Percent</td> <td>100.0%</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td> рә</td> <td>0.0110</td> <td></td>	69.0 Percent	1.0 Percent		Percent	Pei	rcent	Perc	ent	Percent	100.0%				 рә	0.0110	
1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       100.0       Yes         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       100.0       Yes       100.0       Yes         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       100.0       Yes       100.0       Yes         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       Yes       100.0       Yes         1.10       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       Yes       100.0       Yes         1.10       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       Yes       100.0	1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         100.0         100.0         Ves         0.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         100.0         Ves         0.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         100.0         100.0         Ves         0.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         100.0         Ves         0.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         100.0         Ves         0.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         47.6         40.0         65.0         Ves         31.7           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         70.0         90.0         75.0         90.0         75.0         15.0         75.0	O 🖁	<i>Wtd</i> Cum.% <i>Wtd</i> Cum.% Cum. %								Cum. % Passing	1		resmicted Zane	Retair	։լուսոշ	eta Rieve Size % Cieve Size
1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       100.0       Yes         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       100.0       Yes         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       100.0       Yes       20         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       Yes       20         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       70.0       90.0       Yes       20         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       7.4       70.0       90.0       Yes       20         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       7.6       40.0       65.0       Yes       20         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       7.6       70.0       90.0       7.6       1       20       1       20       1	1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       100.0       100.0       100.0       100.0       0.0         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       100.0       100.0       0.0         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0	~	69.0 100.0 1.0		0:0		0.0		0	0:0		100.0 100.0			0.0	00	<u> </u>
1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       100.0       Yes         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       90.0       Yes         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       79.4       70.0       90.0       Yes         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       47.6       400       65.0       Yes       1         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       47.6       400       65.0       Yes       1         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       1.0       Yes       1       1         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       1.0       Yes       1       1         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       1.0       Yes       1       1         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       1.0       Yes       1       1         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       Yes       Yes       1       1         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       Yes	1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       100.0       100.0       Yes       0.0         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       98.0       100.0       Yes       0.0         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       79.4       70.0       99.0       Yes       0.0         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       47.6       40.0       65.0       Yes       31.7         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       31.0       20.0       45.0       Yes       31.7         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       31.0       20.0       45.0       Yes       31.7         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       31.0       70.0       90.0       16.0 </td <td>69.0</td> <td>100.0 1.0</td> <td>_</td> <td>0.0</td> <td></td> <td>0.0</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>0:0</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td> 0.0</td> <td>0.0</td> <td></td>	69.0	100.0 1.0	_	0.0		0.0	0	0	0:0					 0.0	0.0	
1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         vec         2           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         79.4         70.0         90.0         78.5           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         79.4         70.0         90.0         78.5         70.5<	1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         98.0         100.0         Yes         0.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         79.4         70.0         90.0         Yes         206           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         47.6         40.0         65.0         Yes         206           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         25.0         45.0         Yes         205           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         25.0         45.0         Yes         16.6           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         26.0         Yes         16.6           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         Yes         16.6           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         79.0         Yes         16.6           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         20.0         Yes         10.9           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         20.0	69.0 1	100.0 1.0	_	0.0		0.0	0	01	0:0		100.0 100.			0.0	0.0	
1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       79.4       70.0       90.0       Yes       2         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       47.6       40.0       65.0       Yes       3         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       47.6       40.0       65.0       Yes       3         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       31.0       20.0       Yes       3         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       31.0       20.0       Yes       3         1.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       0.0       10.0       Yes       3       3       1       1       1       1       1       1       1       3       1	1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         70.0         90.0         Yes         20.6           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         47.6         40.0         65.0         Yes         20.5           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         47.6         40.0         65.0         Yes         21.7           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.0         31.0         25.0         Yes         16.6           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         30.0         Yes         10.9           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         30.0         Yes         10.9           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         20.0         Yes         10.9           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         Yes         10.9           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         Yes         10.9           1.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         2.0         Yes         10.9           1.0         0.0	· ·	69.0 100.0 1.0		0.0		0.0	0	10	0.0		98.0 100.			 0.0	0.0	
1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         47.6         40.0         65.0         Yes         3           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         20.0         45.0         Yes         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         20.0         45.0         Yes         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         Yes         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         7.2         10.0         7es         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         Yes         1           1.1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         Yes         1           1.1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         Yes         1         1           1.1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         1.0         Yes         1         1           1.1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         1.0         Yes         1 <td>1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         47.6         40.0         65.0         Yes         31.7           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         20.0         45.0         Yes         16.6           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         78.0         78.5           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         78.0         16.6           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         78.0         10.9           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         78.0         78.0         80.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         79.0         78.0         80.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         70.0         79.0         79.0         80.0           1.0.1         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         79.0         79.0         80.0           1.0.1         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         70.0</td> <td></td> <td>61.3 100.0 1.0</td> <td>_</td> <td>0.0</td> <td></td> <td>0.0</td> <td>0</td> <td>10</td> <td>0.0</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td> 20.6</td> <td>20.6</td> <td>No. 4</td>	1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         47.6         40.0         65.0         Yes         31.7           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         20.0         45.0         Yes         16.6           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         78.0         78.5           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         78.0         16.6           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         78.0         10.9           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         78.0         78.0         80.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         79.0         78.0         80.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         70.0         79.0         79.0         80.0           1.0.1         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         79.0         79.0         80.0           1.0.1         0.0         0.0         0.0         10.0         70.0		61.3 100.0 1.0	_	0.0		0.0	0	10	0.0					 20.6	20.6	No. 4
1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         20.0         45.0         Yes         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         20.0         45.0         Yes         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         30.0         Yes         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         12.2         10.0         Yes         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         12.2         10.0         Yes         1         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         Yes         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         1.0         Yes         1         1         Yes         1         Yes         1         Yes         1         Yes         1         Yes	1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         31.0         20.0         45.0         Yes         16.6           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         30.0         Yes         10.9           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         1.2.2         10.0         765         10.9         10.9           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         1.2.2         10.0         765         10.9         10.9           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         10.0         Yes         8.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         10.0         Yes         8.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         1.0.2         4.2         2.0         10.0         Yes         8.0	41.6	100.0 1.0		0.0		0.0	0	10	0.0					 31.7	52.4	No. 8
1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         30.0         Yes         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         122         100         Yes         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         122         100         Yes         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         Yes         1         1           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         10.0         Yes         1	1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         20.1         10.0         30.0         Yes         10.0         10.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         1.2.2         10.0         Yes         8.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         10.0         Yes         8.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         10.0         Yes         8.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         1.0.2         4.2         2.0         10.0         Yes         8.0           Inder Fercent, (%):         8.3         AsphaltSpec. Grav.:         1.025         1.026 </td <td>27.7 1</td> <td>100.0 1.0</td> <td></td> <td>0.0</td> <td></td> <td>0.0</td> <td>0</td> <td>10</td> <td>0.0</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td> 16.6</td> <td>69.0</td> <td></td>	27.7 1	100.0 1.0		0.0		0.0	0	10	0.0					 16.6	69.0	
1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         1.0         20.0         Yes           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         12.2         10.0         Yes         10.0         Yes           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         Yes         10.0         Yes           1.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         Yes         10.0         Yes           1.0         1.0         Yes         3.3         AsphaltSpec. Grav.:         1.025         10.0         Yes	1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         1.2         10.0         20.0         Yes         8.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         10.0         Yes         8.0           1.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         10.0         Yes         8.0           Binder Percent, (%):         8.3         AsphattSpec. Grav.:         1.025         1.026	17.7 10	100.0 1.0	_	0.0		0.0	0	01	0.0					10.9	79.9	_
1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         10.0         Yes           Binder Percent, (%):         8.3         Asphalt Spec. Grav.:         1.025	1.0         0.0         0.0         0.0         4.2         2.0         10.0         Yes         8.0           Binder Percent, (%):         8.3         AsphattSpec. Grav.:         1.025	9	10.1 100.0 1.0		0.0		0.0	0	10	0.0					 8.0	87.8	œ.
8.3 Asphalt Spec. Grav.:	8.3 Asphalt Spec. Grav.:	2.5 100.0		_	0.0		0.0	0	01	0.0					8.0		95.8 No.
8.3 Asphalt Spec. Grav.:	8.3 Asphalt Spec. Grav.:																
	Percent. (%): 1	Asphalt Source & Grade: PG 70-22 0r PG76-22		_	Binder F	<sup>p</sup> ercent,			sphalt Spi	ec. Grav.:							

File Version: 06/15/06 15:19:42

SAMPLE DATE: LETTING DATE:

SAMPLE ID: Special spec. CAM LOT NUMBER:

Refresh Workbook

HMACP MIXTURE DESIGN : COMBINED GRADATION

# Figure 1. Original Mix Design Used on BUS 59 Project in Lufkin.

It was suspected that the current procedures will give binder contents toward the upper end of the acceptable window. The concern here was that a) for CAM mixes the asphalt is paid for as a separate item so there is no incentive to take asphalt out of the mix, and b) as operational tolerances permit  $\pm 0.3$  percent asphalt then there is a possibility that rich mixes could end up with too much asphalt and consequently stability problems in demanding locations (corners, stop signs, etc.)

In the balanced mix design approach the performance tests are run first at a range of asphalt contents. Once the asphalt content gets too high the mix will fail the HWTT and too low it will fail the OT criteria (750 cycles). An acceptable range of asphalt contents is therefore defined and the optimal is selected from within that range (normally the middle of the range). Once the new optimum is selected a volumetric check is performed in a Superpave Gyratory Compactor with 50 gyrations, the mix must achieve a minimum of the 96.5 percent of the maximum theoretical density to be acceptable.

In doing the redesign two PG graded binders were used, a PG76-22 and PG70-22. The two balance mix designs for Lufkin CAM were carried out by Texas Transportation Institute (TTI) on July and August 2009, which was based on the original design combined gradation.

## **Obtaining The Correct Mix Gradation**

In performing the redesign a new set of materials were obtained from the Lufkin District. The first challenge was that the new materials were of a very different gradation of that presented in Figure 1. In order to match the gradation of the original design, TTI technicians sieved each rock to individual size particles and then batched them based on the original design combined gradation for mixing and molding. The current new materials and the original design gradation are shown in Table 1.

Sieve	New mat	erials	Original gradation from the designed spreadsheet		
Size	Jones Mill 3/8"	Screenings	Jones Mill 3/8"	Screenings	
1"	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	
3/4"	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	
1/2"	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	
3/8"	99.4	100.0	100.0	100.0	
No. 4	39.9	78.4	56.7	88.9	
No. 8	7.6	33.3	16.7	60.3	
No. 16	3.6	14.9	7.6	40.2	
No. 30	2.6	8.1	4.9	25.6	
No. 50	2.3	4.5	3.7	14.6	
No. 200	1.9	1.3	2.4	3.6	

Table 1. Comparing the Gradation of Each Rock (the Percentage of Cumulative Passing).

After re-sieving and combining, the TTI tests were performed on exactly the same gradation as that shown in Figure 1.

## The Hamburg and Overlay Testing Results

Three trial asphalt contents, i.e., 7.0 percent, 7.5 percent, and 8.0 percent, were chosen to mold the Hamburg and Overlay samples for each asphalt binder (i.e., PG76-22 and PG70-22). The Hamburg and Overlay testing results of those samples are shown in Table 2 and Table 3, respectively.

Asphalt Binder	Sample's No.	Air Void	Rutting	Pass or Not
	7.0% Asphalt	7.7 / 7.8	2.6 mm @ 20,000	yes
PG76-22	7.5% Asphalt	7.8 / 7.9	2.9 mm @ 20,000	yes
	8.0% Asphalt	7.1 / 7.6	3.6 mm @ 20,000	yes
	7.0% Asphalt	7.7 / 7.6	5.2 mm @ 15,000	yes
PG70-22	7.5% Asphalt	7.8 / 7.8	11.7 mm @ 15,000	yes
	8.0% Asphalt	7.6 / 7.4	17.8 mm @ 15,000	no

Table 2. Hamburg Testing Results.

 Table 3. Overlay Testing Results.

Asphalt Binder	Sample's No.	Max load at first cycle	Cycles of failure	Pass or Not
	7.0% Asphalt_1	543.8	>1000	yes
PG76-22	7.0% Asphalt_2	562.0	>1000	yes
1070-22	7.5% Asphalt_1	602.2	>1000	yes
	8.0% Asphalt_1	457.1	>1000	yes
	7.0% Asphalt_1	448.4	>1000	yes
PG70-22	7.0% Asphalt_2	445.8	>1000	yes
	7.5% Asphalt_1	393.3	>1000	yes

From Table 2 and Table 3, the following observations can be obtained:

1) For PG76-22:

- The resistance rutting as measured in the HWTT was no problem for the three trial asphalt contents; even at 8.0 percent, the rutting level was only 3.6 mm.
- All three asphalt contents easily passed the OT criteria of 750 cycles.

2) For PG70-22:

- The 7.0 percent asphalt passed the HWTT; the 7.5 percent was very close to failure (i.e., <12.5 mm @ 15,000 cycles).
- For the three trial asphalt contents, the mix had no problem meeting the OT criteria.

## **Volumetric Check**

(1) PG76-22

For PG76-22, the 7.5 percent asphalt content was selected to run the volumetric check. The test results are listed in Table 4. At 50 gyrations the mix was easy to compact reaching a density of 97.5 percent of the maximum. From Table 4, if the target density was 98.0 percent, by interpolate, the minimum gyrations would be 62. Test results are also presented for the compaction achieved after 75 gyrations.

	Vol	umetric Ch	eck @ 50 a	und 75 Gyra	tions		
Sample's No.	Gyrations	RICE	Sample Height /mm	Weight of Dry Sample	Sample Weight in Water	Weight of Dry Surface	Density
7.5%_50_1	50	2.3676	115.9	4639.4	2624.2	4642.8	97.5%
7.5%_50_2	50	2.3676	115.6	4641.5	2627.1	4644.4	97.370
7.5%_75_1	75	2.3676	114.9	4684.1	2675.3	4685.3	98.8%

Table 4.	Volumetr	ic Check.
----------	----------	-----------

## (2) PG70-22

For PG70-22, since the highest asphalt content passing the HWTT was 7.5 percent (but all three trial asphalt contents passed or exceeded the Overlay criteria), a 7.2 percent asphalt content was chosen for the volumetric check. The test results are listed in Table 5.

		Volumetric	Check @ 5	0 and 75 Gy	rations		
Sample's No.	Gyrations	RICE	Sample Height /mm	Weight of Dry Sample	Sample Weight in Water	Weight of Dry Surface	Density
7.2%_1	50	2.3752	119.5	4664.9	2600.2	4673.5	94.5%

 Table 5. Volumetric Check for PG70-22 Asphalt.

From Table 5, it can be found that 7.2 percent asphalt content was too low and it was not possible to achieve the 96.5 percent target density. As the 7.5 percent was close to failing the HWTT, it was concluded that it was not possible to arrive at a satisfactory design for the PG70-22 binder.

# CONCLUSIONS

Based on the testing results, the following conclusions are drawn:

- 1) 7.5 percent asphalt content was the optimum if PG76-22 asphalt binder was used.
- 2) PG70-22 was not recommended to use for this CAM design.

This optimum binder content is well below the 8.3 percent binder, which was designed using SS 3109 and used in the field.